Indicator Rubric for Superintendent Evaluation

*The **Indicator Rubric for Superintendent Evaluation** is an evaluation tool intended to support a shared understanding of effective leadership practice between a superintendent and school committee members.*

Designed around the 21 Indicators from the Standards of Effective Administrative Leadership (603 CMR 35.04), the Indicator Rubric includes descriptions of a superintendent's practice for each *Indicator* and articulates the specific responsibilities that a school committee may be expected to reasonably evaluate. This is a significant departure from the more detailed, *element*-level rubrics associated with other educator roles in the model system for educator evaluation.

While this structural difference results in a shorter, less complex evaluation tool, it does *not* simplify the responsibilities of a superintendent. All 21 Indicators associated with the four Standards of Effective Administrative Leadership remain in place, and the superintendent is still expected to meet expectations associated with each Standard, typically assessed by focusing on one to two Indicators per Standard each year. Describing practice at the Indicator level rather than at the element level acknowledges the following unique components of an educator evaluation process conducted by a school committee:

- **The *Role* of the School Committee***:* The school committee's role is governance, rather than management. A school committee thereby focuses on the *what* and the *why* (governance) of superintendent leadership, rather than the *how* (management). The Indicator Rubric does the same.
- **The *Composition* of a School Committee***:* The school committee as "evaluator" is comprised of multiple individuals, rather than a single evaluator. This demands consensus building, a process made exponentially easier when focused around fewer descriptors of practice.
- **The *Focus* of a School Committee***:* School committee members, many of whom are often non-educators, focus primarily on the outcome of a superintendent's work, rather than the details of implementation. The Indicator Rubric guides committee members to maintain this focus.
- **A *Public* Process**. The superintendent's evaluation is the only educator evaluation conducted in public. The Indicator Rubric includes the practices to which a committee can reasonably be expected to have access or insight, such that the public process of collecting and evaluating evidence may be conducted with transparency and integrity.

STANDARD I: Instructional Leadership

The education leader promotes the learning and growth of all students and the success of all staff by cultivating a shared vision that makes powerful teaching and learning the central focus of schooling.

	Unsatisfactory	Needs Improvement	Proficient	Exemplary
I-A: Curriculum	Does not ensure the implementation of standards-based units of instruction across the district (e.g. fails to provide adequate resources or training).	Ensures that most instructional staff implement standards-based units of instruction consisting of well-structured lessons, but curricula in some schools or content areas lack appropriate rigor or alignment to state standards.	Monitors and assesses progress across all schools and content areas to **ensure that all instructional staff implement effective and rigorous standards-based units of instruction consisting of well-structured lessons with measurable outcomes.**	Empowers administrators to ensure all instructional staff collaboratively plan, adapt as needed, and implement standards-based units comprised of well-structured lessons aligned to state standards and local curricula. Continually monitors and assesses progress, and provides additional supports as needed. Models this practice for others.
I-B: Instruction	Does not ensure that instructional practices across schools and content areas reflect high expectations for teaching and learning, are engaging and motivating, or meet the diverse learning of all students; or establishes inappropriately low expectations for teaching and learning.	Supports instructional practices in some schools or content areas that reflect high expectations, engage all students, and are personalized to accommodate diverse learning styles, needs, interests, and levels of readiness; but allows lower expectations and/or insufficiently engaging instruction to persist in parts of the district.	Monitors and supports principals and instructional staff through observations and feedback to **ensure that instructional practices in all settings reflect high expectations regarding content and quality of effort and work, engage all students, and are personalized to accommodate diverse learning styles, needs, interests, and levels of readiness**.	Sets high expectations for the content and quality of instruction and empowers all administrators to do the same, such that instructional practices throughout the district are engaging, inclusive, and personalized to accommodate diverse learning needs of all students. Stays informed of new, evidenced-based instructional practices and provides resources and supports to implement them as needed. Monitors principals and instructional staff in support of these practices through observations and feedback.

	Unsatisfactory	Needs Improvement	Proficient	Exemplary
I-C: Assessment (Goal 1)	Does not set expectations around or ensure the use of a variety of formal and informal assessment methods throughout the district.	Encourages most principals and administrators to facilitate practices that propel personnel to use a variety of formal and informal methods and assessments to measures student learning, growth, and understanding, but assessment use and analysis is inconsistent throughout the district.	Monitors and supports principals and instructional staff through observations and feedback to **ensure that all principals and administrators facilitate practices that propel personnel to use a variety of formal and informal methods and assessments to measure student learning, growth, and understanding and make necessary adjustments to their practice when students are not learning.**	Empowers teams of administrators and instructional staff to use a comprehensive system of informal and formal assessment methods to measure each student's learning, growth, and progress toward achieving state/local standards, and to use findings to adjust instructional practice and implement appropriate interventions and enhancements for students. Ensures alignment of assessments to content and grade level standards, and monitors administrators' efforts and successes in this area. Models this practice for others.
I-D: Evaluation (Goal 1)	Does not supervise and evaluate administrators in alignment with state regulations or contract provisions, such that: ● Administrators' goals are neither SMART nor aligned to school and/or district goals, and/or ● Administrators rarely provide quality supervision and evaluation to other staff; and/or ● Administrators are rarely, if ever, observed and provided with feedback on their own leadership practice.	Supervises and evaluates administrators in alignment with state regulations and contract provisions, but: ● Some administrator goals may not be SMART or aligned to school and district priorities; and/or ● Observations of and feedback to staff by other administrators is inconsistent or nonspecific; and/or ● Observations of and feedback to administrators by the superintendent are inconsistent or nonspecific.	**Provides effective and timely supervision and evaluation of all staff in alignment with state regulations and contract provisions,** as evidenced by: ● Support to all administrators in developing SMART goals aligned to school and district priorities, ● Guidance, support and monitoring for all administrators to ensure they observe and provide useful feedback to faculty and staff, and ● Frequent observations of and feedback to administrators on effective leadership practice.	Provides effective and timely supervision and evaluation of all staff in alignment with state regulations and contract provisions, as evidenced by: ● Support to all administrators to develop and attain SMART goals aligned to school and district priorities, and sharing best practices and success with the district community; ● Guidance, support and monitoring for all administrators to ensure they observe and provide useful feedback to faculty and staff; ● Frequent observations of and feedback to administrators on effective leadership practice. Models this process through the superintendent's own evaluation process and goals.

	Unsatisfactory	Needs Improvement	Proficient	Exemplary
I-E: Data-Informed Decision Making (Goal 1)	Gathers limited information on district strengths and weaknesses and writes district and annual action plans that lack data-informed goals.	Identifies multiple sources of evidence related to student learning to assess the district's strengths and areas for improvement, but these data are not comprehensive and/or analysis is insufficient, such that district and annual action plans lack focused or measurable goals.	**Uses multiple sources of evidence related to student learning, including state, district, and school assessment results and growth data, to inform district goals and improve organizational performance, educator effectiveness, and student learning.** Regularly monitors and shares progress with the community. Supports principals to align school improvement goals to district plans and goals.	Leads administrator teams in identifying and using multiple sources of evidence including state, district, and school assessment results and growth data, educator evaluation data, district culture and climate information, to assess and communicate the district's strengths and areas for improvement. Involves stakeholders in the creation of district improvement and annual action plans comprised of measurable, results-oriented goals, and empowers principals to develop and implement similarly robust and aligned school plans and goals. Regularly monitors and shares progress with the community.
I-F: Student Learning	**Demonstrates expected impact on student learning based on multiple measures of student learning, growth, and achievement, including student progress on common assessments and statewide student growth measures where available.** *There are no associated performance descriptors for the Student Learning Indicator.* For administrators, evidence of impact on student learning based on multiple measures of student learning, growth, and achievement must be taken into account by the evaluator(s) when determining a performance rating for Standard I. Evaluators and educators should identify the most appropriate assessments of student learning and anticipated student learning gains associated with those measures when developing the Educator Plan. For superintendents and other district leaders, multiple measures of student learning might include (but should not be limited to) statewide assessments, assessments from curricular materials used in multiple schools, district-created common assessments, or others measures that provide information about student learning across the district.			

STANDARD II: Management and Operations

Promotes the learning and growth of all students and the success of all staff by ensuring a safe, efficient, and effective learning environment, using resources to implement appropriate curriculum, staffing, and scheduling.

	Unsatisfactory	Needs Improvement	Proficient	Exemplary
II-A. Environment	Fails to establish plans, procedures, routines, and operational systems that address the safety, health, and emotional and social needs of students throughout the district, such that schools and other buildings are not generally clean, attractive, welcoming, or safe.	Oversees plans, procedures, routines, and operational systems that address the safety, health, and emotional and social needs of students, but allows for variation in implementation and/or quality across the district, such that not all students have equitable access to clean, safe, and supportive learning environments.	**Develops and executes effective plans, procedures, routines, and operational systems to address a full range of safety, health, and emotional and social needs of students throughout the district,** as evidenced by: ● orderly and efficient student entry, dismissal, meals, class transitions, assemblies, and recess; ● school and district buildings that are clean, attractive, welcoming, and safe; and ● safe and supportive learning environments for all students.	Empowers all administrators to develop and execute effective plans, procedures, routines, and operational systems to address a full range of safety, health, and emotional and social needs of all students throughout the district, as evidenced by: ● orderly and efficient student entry, dismissal, meals, class transitions, assemblies, and recess; ● school and district buildings that are clean, attractive, welcoming, and safe; and ● safe and supportive learning environments for all students. Assesses efficacy using feedback from students, staff, and families, and other data sources, and makes adjustments as necessary. Models this practice for others.

	Unsatisfactory	Needs Improvement	Proficient	Exemplary
II-B. Human Resources Management & Development	Does not implement any formal processes for the recruitment and hiring of faculty and staff, and/or fails to provide sufficient induction, development, or career growth supports to educators, as evidenced by an inability to reliably hire and retain educators that meet the learning needs of district students.	Oversees processes for recruitment, hiring, induction, development, and career growth, but systems are inadequately or inconsistently implemented throughout the district, and/or do not consistently promote the hiring, retention, and support of a diverse, effective educator workforce.	Monitors and supports the **implementation of a cohesive approach to recruitment, hiring, induction, development, and career growth that promotes high-quality and effective practice,** as evidenced by districtwide systems that support: ● Hiring and retaining a diverse workforce; ● Comprehensive induction supports for new educators; ● Job-embedded professional development aligned with district goals; and ● Distributed leadership opportunities to support educator career growth.	Ensures a districtwide system for recruiting, hiring, and retaining an effective and diverse workforce of administrators and educators who share the district's mission and meet the learning needs of all students, as evidenced by: ● comprehensive induction supports for all new educators; ● job-embedded professional learning that (a) reinforces district goals, (b) results in high-quality and effective practice; and ● formalized distributed leadership and career growth opportunities. Empowers all administrators to implement these systems consistently.
II-C. Scheduling and Management Information Systems	Does not implement systems to ensure optimal use of time for teaching, learning, or collaboration, such that instructional time is inadequate and/or routinely disrupted, and administrators have limited to no opportunities to collaborate around meaningful practice.	Encourages the use of scheduling and management information systems that promote time for teaching and learning, but does not monitor efficacy throughout the district and/or allows for frequent schedule disruptions; provides inadequate time for administrators to collaborate around leadership practice.	**Uses systems to ensure optimal use of time for teaching, learning, and collaboration,** as evidenced by: ● school schedules that maximize student access to quality instructional time and minimize school day disruptions; and ● regular opportunities for administrators to collaborate.	Empowers administrators and teams to contribute to the design and monitoring of district systems that maximize access to quality instructional time for all students, and minimize disruptions and distractions for all school-level staff. Supports ongoing administrator collaboration within and across schools.

	Unsatisfactory	Needs Improvement	Proficient	Exemplary
II-D. Laws, Ethics and Policies	Demonstrates lack of awareness or consistent non-compliance with some or all state and federal laws and mandates, school committee policies, or collective bargaining agreements, and/or fails to adhere to ethical guidelines.	May know state and federal laws and mandates, school committee policies, and collective bargaining agreements, but inconsistently complies with some laws or policies, and/or ethical guidelines.	**Understands and complies with state and federal laws and mandates, school committee policies, collective bargaining agreements, and ethical guidelines,** and provides the resources and support to ensure district-wide compliance.	Provides the resources and support for all school personnel to understand and comply with state and federal laws and mandates, school committee policies, collective bargaining agreements, and ethical guidelines. Models this practice for others.
II-E. Fiscal Systems (Goal 3)	Develops a budget that does not align with the district's goals or mismanages available resources. Does not communicate budget rationale or financial short falls to staff, community members, municipal stakeholders, or the school committee.	Develops a budget that loosely aligns with the district's vision, mission, and goals, and/or inconsistently manages expenditures and available resources. Does not effectively communicate budget rationale to staff, community members, municipal stakeholders, and the school committee.	**Develops a budget that supports the district's vision, mission, and goals; allocates and manages expenditures consistent with district/school-level goals and available resources;** and effectively communicates budget rationale to staff, community members, municipal stakeholders, and the school committee. Provides regular updates on implementation of the budget.	Leads the administrator team to develop a district budget aligned with the district's vision, mission, and goals that addresses the needs of all students. Allocates and manages expenditures consistent with district/school-level goals, and seeks alternate funding sources as needed. Proactively communicates budget rationale to staff, community members, municipal stakeholders, and the school committee. Provides regular updates on implementation of the budget.

STANDARD III: Family and Community Engagement

Promotes the learning and growth of all students and the success of all staff through effective partnerships with families, community organizations, and other stakeholders that support the mission of the school and district.

	Unsatisfactory	Needs Improvement	Proficient	Exemplary
III-A. Engagement (Goal 2)	Does little to welcome families as members of the district, classroom or school community, or tolerates an environment that is unwelcoming to some families.	**Invites families to participate in the classroom and school community,** but efforts are limited or insufficient, leading to limited family involvement throughout the district.	Promotes, monitors and supports comprehensive, culturally responsive and collaborative engagement practices that **welcome and encourage every family to actively participate in the classroom and school community,** and engages community stakeholders to contribute to the classroom, school, and community's effectiveness.	Ensures that all personnel to use culturally responsive and collaborative practices that engage all families to contribute to district, classroom, school, and community effectiveness, including but not limited to families with limited access to technology, and families whose home language is not English. Actively engages stakeholders from all segments of the community, including residents, municipal officials, and business leaders, in furthering the mission of the school and the district. Models this practice for others.
III-B. Sharing Responsibility	Does not ensure that administrators are identifying student learning and development needs and working with families to address them.	Encourages administrators to work with families to address students struggling academically or behaviorally, but does not consistently monitor these activities to ensure that student needs are being met, either within or outside of schools.	Monitors adherence to district-wide policies and practices that promote **continuous collaboration with families to support student learning and development both at home and at school,** as evidenced by: ● the collaborative identification of each student's academic, social, emotional, and behavioral needs**;** and ● connecting families to the necessary resources and services within the school and the community to meet students' learning needs.	Empowers all administrators to regularly collaborate with families to address each student's academic, social, emotional, and behavioral needs, and to access as needed necessary services within and outside of schools to address those needs. Monitors these processes to ensure all student needs are being met. Models this practice for others.

	Unsatisfactory	Needs Improvement	Proficient	Exemplary
III-C. Communication	Does not set clear expectations for or provide support to administrators regarding regular or culturally sensitive communication with families, and/or allows culturally insensitive, inappropriate, or disrespectful communications with families to occur. District communication regarding student learning and performance occurs primarily through school report cards.	May set expectations regarding regular, two-way, culturally proficient communications with families, but allows occasional communications that are culturally insensitive to some families' home language, culture, and values. District communication primarily occurs through school newsletters and other one-way media.	**Engages in regular, two-way, culturally proficient communication with families and community stakeholders about student learning and performance,** that is provided in multiple formats and reflects understanding of and respect for different families' home languages, culture, and values.	Supports and empowers all administrators to engage in regular, two-way, culturally responsive communications with families about student learning and performance. District-wide communications with families are provided in multiple formats and respect and affirm different families' home language**s**, culture, and values.
III-D. Family Concerns (Goal 2)	Does not address most family concerns in a timely or effective manner, fails to provide systems or supports for administrators to do the same, and/or allows responses to be inconsistent or insufficient. Resolutions are often not in the best interest of students.	Ensures that most family concerns are addressed as they arise, but responsiveness is inconsistent across the district. Supports administrators to reach solutions to family concerns, but may not ensure equitable resolutions that are in the best interest of students.	**Addresses family concerns in an equitable, effective, and efficient manner,** and supports administrators to seek equitable resolutions to both academic and non-academic concerns that (a) reflect relevant information from all parties including families, faculty, and staff, and (b) are in the best interest of students.	Ensures that all family concerns are addressed in a timely and effective manner throughout the district; empowers administrators to proactively respond as academic or non-academic concerns arise; and promotes collaborative problem solving processes informed by relevant input from all families, faculty, and staff that result in equitable solutions that are in the best interest of students. Models this practice for others.

STANDARD IV: Professional Culture

Promotes success for all students by nurturing and sustaining a school culture of reflective practice, high expectations, and continuous learning for staff.

	Unsatisfactory	Needs Improvement	Proficient	Exemplary
IV-A. Commitment to High Standards (Goal 1 & 3)	Does not encourage high standards of teaching and learning or high expectations for achievement among administrators, as evidenced by: 1. a failure to develop or articulate the district's mission or core values; and 2. an inability or unwillingness to lead administrator leadership meetings that inform school and district matters.	May articulate high standards for teaching and learning, but expectations are inconsistently applied throughout the district, as evidenced by: 1. Mission and core values are present but may not reflect district-wide buy-in, or are rarely used to inform decision-making. 2. Meetings: Leads administrator leadership meetings that address matters of consequence but may not result in meaningful decision-making.	**Fosters a shared commitment to high standards of teaching and learning with high expectations for achievement for all, including:** **1. Mission and core values: Develops, promotes, and secures staff commitment to core values that guide the development of a succinct, results-oriented mission statement and ongoing decision-making.** **2. Meetings: Plans and leads well-run and engaging meetings that have clear purpose, focus on matters of consequence, and engage participants in a thoughtful and productive series of conversations and deliberations about important school matters.**	Established a district-wide commitment to high standards of teaching and learning with high expectations for achievement for all, including: 1. Mission and core values: Collaborates with educators and community members to develop, secure and/or promote core values and an aligned mission, and to use them to guide decision making. 2. Meetings: Empowers administrators to share responsibility for leading team meetings that address important district matters, and foster collaborative learning and problem-solving around instructional leadership issues. Models this practice for others.

	Unsatisfactory	Needs Improvement	Proficient	Exemplary
IV-B. Cultural Proficiency	Develops and implements culturally insensitive or inappropriate policies and practices, does not support administrators and staff in building cultural proficiency, and/or fosters a culture that minimizes the importance of individual differences.	Takes pride in having a diverse administration, faculty and/or student body, but some policies and practices are not culturally responsive; and/or provides limited resources for administrators to support the development of culturally responsive learning environments and school culture that affirms individual differences.	**Ensures that policies and practices enable staff members and students to interact effectively in a culturally diverse environment in which students' backgrounds, identities, strengths, and challenges are respected,** as evidenced by the sufficient provision of guidance, supports, and resources to all schools to promote culturally responsive learning environments and school cultures that affirm individual differences of both students and staff.	Leads stakeholders to develop and implement culturally responsive policies and practices that acknowledge the diverse backgrounds, identities, strengths, and challenges of administrators, students and staff. Empowers administrators with time, resources, and supports to build culturally responsive learning environments and collaborates with community members to create a culture that affirms individual differences. Models this practice for others.
IV-C. Communications (Goal 2)	Demonstrates ineffectual interpersonal, written, or verbal communication skills at times, such that staff, families and community members, and/or the school committee lack accurate or sufficient information.	Demonstrates adequate interpersonal, written, and verbal communication skills, but outreach to staff, families and community members, and/or the school committee may be inconsistent or unclear.	**Demonstrates strong interpersonal, written, and verbal communication skills**, as evidenced by regular and informative outreach to staff, families and community members, and the school committee in a manner that advances the work of the district**.** Regularly seeks and considers feedback in decision-making.	Utilizes and models strong context- and audience-specific interpersonal, written, and verbal communication skills. Actively seeks and incorporates feedback into decision-making and in communicating rationale for the decisions to staff, family, community members and school committee.

	Unsatisfactory	Needs Improvement	Proficient	Exemplary
IV-D. Continuous Learning (Goal 3)	Accepts the practice of administrators working largely in isolation, without consideration of data and best practices. Does not reflect on leadership practice or demonstrate new ways of thinking about administration and leadership.	Encourages administrators and teams to reflect on the effectiveness of instruction and student learning and use data and best practices to adapt practice, but does not monitor administrators in these practices to ensure consistency or efficacy. Occasionally reflects on their own leadership practice.	**Develops and nurtures a culture in which staff members are reflective about their practice and use student data, current research, best practices and theory to continuously adapt instruction and achieve improved results,** as evidenced by: ● Supporting regular opportunities for administrators and teams to reflect on and collaborate around the effectiveness of a wide range of practices related to instruction and student learning, and ● Engaging in their own continuous learning to improve leadership practice. **Models these behaviors in their own practice.**	Develops, nurtures, and models a culture in which all staff members are reflective about their practice and use student data, current research, best practices and theory to continuously adapt instruction and achieve improved results, as evidenced by: ● Empowering all administrators to collaborate and share knowledge and skills of best practices that improve student learning within their own buildings, and ● Regularly reflecting on and improving their own leadership practice in order to develop new approaches to improve overall district effectiveness.
IV-E. Shared Vision (Goal 1)	Does not engage stakeholders in the creation of or commitment to a shared educational vision, such that the vision is not one in which all students will be prepared to succeed in postsecondary education and become responsible citizens and community contributors.	Engages some administrators, staff, students, families, and community members in developing and committing to a shared educational vision focused on student preparation for college and career readiness, civic engagement, responsible citizenship, and community contributions, but stakeholder engagement is limited and/or the vision is unrepresentative of the district community.	**Continuously engages all stakeholders in the creation of** (or commitment to) **a shared educational vision** focused on student preparation for college and career readiness, civic engagement, community contributions, and responsible citizenship.[1]	Leads administrators, staff, students of all ages, families, and community members to develop and internalize a shared educational vision around student preparation for college and careers, civic engagement, community contributions, and responsible citizenship. Ensures alignment of school and district goals to this vision. Models this practice for others.

[1] The original Indicator language is modified in this rubric to reflect a more expansive definition of student success that is inclusive of college and career readiness. This definition is reflected in the other model rubrics as well as Massachusetts policies and ini mes for all students.

	Unsatisfactory	Needs Improvement	Proficient	Exemplary
IV-F. Managing Conflict	Does not respond to disagreement or dissent and/or does not address conflict in a solutions-oriented or respectful manner. Does not attempt or fails to build consensus within the district and school communities.	Responds respectfully to most cases of disagreement and dissent, but employs only a limited range of strategies to resolve conflict and build consensus within the district and school communities, with varying degrees of success.	**Employs strategies for responding to disagreement and dissent, constructively resolving conflict, and building consensus throughout district and school communities,** while maintaining a commitment to decisions that are in the best interest of all students**.**	Models a variety of strategies for responding respectfully and effectively to disagreement and dissent, and resolves conflicts in a constructive manner such that all parties are able to move forward productively. Regularly strives to achieve consensus within the district and school communities, while maintaining a commitment to decisions that are in the best interest of all students. Empowers and supports administrators to use these approaches in their own leadership.